Criminal Justice Involvement & Its Impact on the Individual, Family and Community

John Hagan, Northwestern University & American Bar Foundation
Holly Foster, Texas A&M University
National Trends in Incarceration

U.S. State and Federal Prison Population, 1925-2013

Number of People

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics Prisoners Series.
State Trends in Incarceration

U.S. prison population trends through 2014: decreases from peak year, increases from 2009

Note: Connecticut, Kansas, and Wisconsin data may not be fully comparable across years. Published February 2016.
Adult Men’s Incarceration: 93% of Incarcerated Population (Carson 2015)
Adult Women’s Incarceration: 7% of Incarcerated Population (Carson 2015)
Importance of Studying both Paternal and Maternal Incarceration

Almost 2/3 of female inmates are mothers of minor children (Glaze and Maruschak 2008)
1. EFFECTS OF ADULT INCARCERATION ON INDIVIDUALS
EFFECTS OF ADULT INCARCERATION ON INDIVIDUALS: Results from Broad-Scale Community Samples

- **Male Incarceration Multiple Influences:**
  - Diminished Earnings (Western 2006)
  - Barriers to Employment (Pager 2003; 2007; Pager, Western, Bonikowski 2009)
  - Risk of Divorce (Western 2006; Massoglia, Remster and King 2011)
  - Diminished Political Participation (Manza and Uggen 2006)
  - Housing Insecurity and Homelessness (Geller and Curtis, 2011)

- **Influences on Health Problems:**
  - *Men’s Health*:
    - Paternal Incarceration and Depression: (Turney, Wildeman and Schnittker 2012);
    - Male Incarceration and Psychiatric Disorders: (Schnittker, Massoglia, and Uggen 2012);
  - *Women’s Health*: Maternal Incarceration and Women’s Self-rated Health: (Turney and Wildeman 2015)
2. ADULT INCARCERATION EFFECTS ON FAMILIES
FAMILY EFFECTS I: IMPACT ON FEMALE PARTNERS OF INCARCERATED MEN

1 in 4 women has a family member in prison.
Male incarceration effects on *adult women*:


- Paternal incarceration effects on diminished maternal mental health (Wildeman, Schnittker, and Turney 2012)

- Paternal incarceration effects on reduced in-kind support for mothers (Turney, Schnittker, and Wildeman 2012)
FAMILY EFFECTS II: EFFECTS OF PARENTAL INCARCERATION
Over Half of Adult Prisoners are Parents (Mumola 2000; Glaze and Maruschak 2008)
• Paternal Incarceration Effects on *Families*:

• Financial Strains (Schwartz-Soicher, Geller and Garfinkel 2011)

• Family Processes and Relationships: Overview by Arditti (2012); Maternal Neglect and Harsh Parenting (Turney 2014)
*Because minority youth are more exposed to incarceration of fathers, they are also more impacted by all the generic and cumulative effects that follow from the incarceration of fathers.*
Major Social Historical Events During Add Health Panel

U.S. State and Federal Prison Population, 1925-2013

- Great Recession
- Add Health Wave I
- Add Health Wave IV

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics Prisoners Series.
Study Design (Add Health)

Longitudinal Design

In-School Administration → In-Home Administration

Wave I 1994-1995
Students 90,118
School Admin 144

Wave II 1996
School Admin 128

Wave III 2001-2002
Adolescents in grades 7-12 (20,745)
Parent 17,670

Wave IV 2007-08
Adolescents in grades 8-12 (14,738)
Partners 1,507
Young Adults Aged 18-26* (15,197)
Adults Aged 24-32** (15,500)

* 24 respondents were 27-28 years old.
** 52 respondents were 33-34 years old.

Measuring Parental Imprisonment in Add Health

- **Wave III: In-Home Sample**
  - “Has your biological father ever served time in jail or prison?” (1=yes).
  - 14.7% biological father incarcerated

- **Wave IV: In-home Sample**
  - “Has/did your biological father ever (spend/spent) time in jail or prison?” (1=yes).
  - 15.6% biological father incarcerated

- **Wave IV: In-home Sample**
  - “Has/did your biological mother ever (spend/spent) time in jail or prison?” (1=yes).
  - 4.2% biological mother incarcerated
Measuring Paternal Incarceration with Add Health

- Reliability (Waves III& IV):
  - Correlation in reports of paternal imprisonment between waves III and IV is $r = 0.63$, ($p < 0.001$).
  - If exclude new onset cases at Wave IV, the correlation across waves is $r = 0.82$, ($p < 0.001$).
Measuring Parental Imprisonment in Add Health

- Chronicity (Wave IV):

- Wave IV: How many times (has/did) your biological mother (spend/spent) time in jail or prison?
  - Mothers: 1-20 times
  - Fathers: 1-53 times
Measuring Parental Imprisonment in Add Health

- **Duration (Wave IV):**
  - How old were you when your biological mother/father went to prison (the *first* time)?
  - How old were you when your biological mother/father went to prison (the *last* time)?
### Examples of Findings on Maternal and Paternal Influences on Children’s Outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maternal Imprisonment</th>
<th>Children’s Internalizing &amp; Externalizing Symptoms</th>
<th>Children’s Social Exclusion &amp; Marginalization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Risk Effects:</strong></td>
<td>Huebner and Gustafson 2007; Foster and Hagan 2013; Hagan and Foster 2012; Lee, Fang, and Luo 2013; Muftic, Bouffard and Armstrong 2016</td>
<td><strong>Risk Effects:</strong> Education (Hagan and Foster 2012b)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Null &amp; Heterogeneous Effects:</strong> Wakefield and Wildeman 2014; Turney and Wildeman 2015; Wildeman and Turney 2014</td>
<td><strong>Null Effects:</strong> Homelessness (Wildeman 2014)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paternal Imprisonment</th>
<th>Risk Effects:</th>
<th>Risk Effects:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wildeman 2010</td>
<td>Education: (Foster and Hagan 2007; Hagan and Foster 2012a; Turney and Haskins 2014)</td>
<td>Homelessness (Wildeman 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murray and Farrington 2005</td>
<td></td>
<td>Powerlessness (Hagan and Foster 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roettger and Swisher 2011</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wakefield and Wildeman 2014</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foster and Hagan 2013</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turney 2014</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Findings on Parental Incarceration from Studies with Add Health:

- 1) Economic & Food Insecurity
- 2) Receipt of Health Services
- 3) College Access & Completion
Measures of Economic & Food Insecurity
(Hagan and Foster, 2015, RSJSS)

- 2001/2008: asked whether able to pay for:
  - Phone
  - Rent/mortgage
  - Utility bills
  - Food

- Assumed basics in developed societies
Percentage of Young Adults Experiencing Any of Four Types of Income Insecurity by Paternal and Maternal Imprisonment (Hagan and Foster 2015)
Percentage of Young Adults Experiencing Food Insecurity in 2007-2008
(Hagan and Foster 2015)
Odds Ratios and Adjusted Odds Ratios from Multivariate Survey Adjusted Logistic Regression Analyses (Hagan and Foster 2015)

- Paternal Imprisonment
- Maternal Imprisonment
- Paternal Imprisonment Adjusted OR
- Maternal Imprisonment Adjusted OR

Bar chart showing:
- Any Income Insecurity 2007-2008
- Food Insecurity 2007-2008
Receipt of Health Services
Proportions Receiving Medical Services When Needed by Parental Incarceration

- Maternal Incarceration
- No Maternal Incarceration
- Paternal Incarceration
- No Paternal Incarceration

***
Mediation of Maternal Incarceration Effect on Receipt of Medical Services (with Multiple Imputation) (W4)

- Maternal Incarceration & full controls
- & Health Insurance
- & Economic Insecurity

Odds Ratios

* -6%
† -32%
Mediation of African American Effect on Receipt of Health Services by Economic Insecurity & Other Factors (W4)

African American & controls

-17%

-28%
3. ADULT INCARCERATION EFFECTS ON COMMUNITIES
IMPACT OF ADULT INCARCERATION ON COMMUNITIES

- Spillover Effects: Maternal and Paternal Levels of Imprisonment in Schools
School Mean Levels of Maternal and Paternal Imprisonment in Representative Sample of American Schools

- School Level Maternal Imprisonment % (Maternal Across School Average=3%)
- School Level Paternal Imprisonment % (Paternal Across School Average=10%)

Sampled Schools

Percentage

30
25
20
15
10
5
0

Sampled Schools
Figure 1. Predicted Probability of College Graduation and Paternal Imprisonment

Predicted Probability of College Graduation

Paternal School Imprisonment Near 0%
Paternal School Imprisonment at 20%

Level of Paternal Imprisonment in the School

Father Never Imprisoned
Father Imprisoned
Spillover Effects

- Not just the children of incarcerated parents

- Also affecting youth in schools where many other children have parents in prison.

  *These schools become “prison places”* (Clear 2007: 68)

- Youth may learn not to conceive of college as mobility route
In advanced U.S. schools, 40% or more of the students graduate from college.

Students with incarcerated fathers have a 25% chance of graduating college, if the school they attend has a paternal incarceration rate near 0%.

Students with incarcerated mothers have a 2% chance of graduating college, if the school they attend has a maternal incarceration rate near 0%.

In schools where the paternal incarceration rate is near 20%, students with an incarcerated father have just a 13% chance of graduating from college, and students whose fathers are not incarcerated also suffer a reduced likelihood of college graduation (25%).

In schools where the maternal incarceration rate is near 10%, students with an incarcerated mother have just a 1% chance of graduating from college, and students whose mothers are not incarcerated also suffer a reduced likelihood of college graduation (25%).
Societal Benefits of Government Investment in Measuring Incarceration Effects on Health Outcomes

- “Historical Time and Place” (Elder 1998): Add Health sample are children of mass incarceration who also endured the Great Recession
- Nationally representative estimates and effects of paternal and maternal incarceration in general community school-based sample
- Paternal incarceration effects measured over time
Societal Benefits of Government Investment in Measuring Incarceration Effects on Health Outcomes

- Spillover effects: Estimates of parental incarceration effects in schools on those with and without an incarcerated parent

- Broad scale study permits investigation of mediating pathways- we have found especially through education and economic deprivation.
Societal Benefits of Government Investment in Measuring Incarceration Effects on Health Outcomes

- Permits investigation of health-specific and broad-scale outcome effects on young adults.

- Longitudinal sample: Potential to investigate effects from adolescent to later adult life course (Wave V).

- Racial/Ethnic Disadvantage: Documents that because minority youth are more exposed to incarceration of fathers, they are also more impacted by all the generic and cumulative effects that follow from the incarceration of fathers.
Add Health Data Acknowledgements:

- This research uses data from Add Health, a program project directed by Kathleen Mullan Harris and designed by J. Richard Udry, Peter S. Bearman, and Kathleen Mullan Harris at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, and funded by grant P01-HD31921 from the Eunice Kennedy Shriver National Institute of Child Health and Human Development, with cooperative funding from 23 other federal agencies and foundations. Special acknowledgment is due Ronald R. Rindfuss and Barbara Entwisle for assistance in the original design. Information on how to obtain the Add Health data files is available on the Add Health website (http://www.cpc.unc.edu/addhealth). No direct support was received from grant P01-HD31921 for this analysis.